

H-Diplo

H-Diplo Article Reviews

<http://www.h-net.org/~diplo/reviews/>

No. 346

Published on 2 March 2012

H-Diplo Article Review Editors: Thomas Maddux and Diane N. Labrosse

Web and Production Editor: George Fujii

Commissioned for H-Diplo by Thomas Maddux

Emmet Kennedy. "Ambassador Carlton J.H. Hayes' Wartime Diplomacy: Making Spain a Haven from Hitler". *Diplomatic History* 36: 2 (April 2012): 237-260. DOI: 10.1111/j.1467-7709.2011.01022.x. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-7709.2011.01022.x>

URL: <http://www.h-net.org/~diplo/reviews/PDF/AR346.pdf>

[NB- An author's Response is available at <http://www.h-net.org/~diplo/reviews/PDF/AR346-Response.pdf>]

Review by **Joan-Maria Thomàs**, Rovira i Virgili University (Tarragona, Spain)

For some time now historiographic interest has returned to the policies of the Roosevelt administration with respect to Franco's Spain. The recent works of Dominic Tierney, *FDR and the Spanish Civil War: Neutrality and Commitment in the Struggle that Divided America* (Durham, NC, 2007), Michael E. Chapman, *Arguing Americanism. Franco Lobbyists, Roosevelt's Foreign Policy and the Spanish Civil War*, New Studies in U.S. Foreign Relations Series, Kent. OH, 2011, and my own *Roosevelt and Franco during the Second World War* (New York, 2008), and *Roosevelt, Franco and the End of the Second World War* (New York, 2011) are examples of this renewal after the boom of interest in the Spanish Civil War during the nineteen sixties and seventies, and which later entered into a prolonged slumber.

Kennedy's article may be included in this new wave. He is a recognised specialist in the cultural aspects of the history of revolutionary France, while his best-known work is in fact *A Cultural History of the French Revolution* (Yale, 1991). Over the last few years Kennedy has become interested in the leading historian and ambassador to Spain during the years 1942-1945, Carlton J.H. Hayes. In this article he focuses on Hayes' actions with regards to the refugee problem which arose in Franco's Spain after Operation Torch (November 1942), the subsequent German occupation of Vichy France, and the occupation of the entire French-Spanish border. The aforementioned occupation first resulted in a migratory wave and later a steady trickle of clandestine entries into Spain. Notable among those involved in this migration were French citizens of military recruitment age who wished to join the Free France Army in North Africa, however escapees also included refugees of other nationalities who were escaping from the Nazis;

among them Allied pilots, especially North Americans and British aviators who had been shot down over German-occupied Europe, as well as Jews.

What is striking in Kennedy's work is his broad mastery of sources, from the archives of France and Spain to bibliographies and a thorough study of the media, especially books and articles written by Spaniards, not to mention North Americans and English authors, something which is none-too frequent among Anglo-Saxon historians who are not specifically hispanists.

The author questions the role of Hayes and his staff of the Madrid Embassy with respect to the issue of the refugees, and the actions they took in order to keep the border open despite German pressure on the Spanish government to close it. Hayes investigates the true number of people who managed to cross the frontier and who were subsequently interned in concentration camps or in Spanish prisons as an intermediate step in the process of their release and later journeys to Portugal or Africa. He analyses the disputes which took place in Spain between the American agency responsible for the refugees and the embassy itself, before finally asking if more could have been done for them. The article retains an overall character which somehow seeks to reassess both the character and actions of Hayes, who in his own country, both at the time, and later, was reputed to have had pro-Franco leanings, and was accused of being neither particularly interested nor active in the refugee issue.

Kennedy examines the data provided by different authors - especially French writers - who have quantified the number of departures, and concludes, with Stanley G. Payne, that the exact figures will never be known. He does, however, emphasise the importance of reconstructing the journey or the different journeys which the refugees followed within Spain after their arrival there.

At the same time he also examines the modifications in Franco's policy with respect to the matter of the refugees; amendments which would go hand in hand with the change of fortune which took place in the Second World War from early 1943, in addition to changes which encouraged Franco and his successive Ministers of Foreign Affairs from 1942 to 1945 (Jordana and Lequerica) to be increasingly benevolent and receptive to Allied demands, including the refugee issue. This involved a modification of Spain's sluggish re-orientation, which was by no means a simple process. Spanish policy redirection advanced more on the basis of conflicts and even ultimatums than on other means of persuasion, as was seen following the so-called Battle of Wolfram which took place from January to May in 1944, when the United States - notably overriding the more bargaining-orientated Britain - forced Franco to make important concessions.

The only criticism I feel must be made of Kennedy's work is that it is not more critical with regard to the figure of Hayes, given that the latter, during several periods of his ambassadorship, showed such a degree of affinity - one which was authentic and by no means affected - with the Franco Regime. In fact Hayes had no problems in portraying

the flawless image of the regime's political behaviour and the reasons behind its decisions in the self-justifying autobiography he wrote on his return to the United States, *Wartime Mission in Spain* (New York, 1945). This affinity marked his later career as a supporter of Franco's Regime in America for as long as he lived.

Joan Maria Thomàs is Professor of History at the University Rovira Virgili (Tarragona, Spain) and member of the Royal Academy of History of Spain. He has recently published *Roosevelt, Franco, and the End of the Second World War* (NY, Palgrave, 2011) and *Los Fascismos Españoles* (Barcelona, Planeta, 2011). He is doing research on U.S.-Spanish Relations after the Second World War.

Copyright © 2012 H-Net: Humanities and Social Sciences Online.

H-Net permits the redistribution and reprinting of this work for non-profit, educational purposes, with full and accurate attribution to the author(s), web location, date of publication, H-Diplo, and H-Net: Humanities & Social Sciences Online. For other uses, contact the H-Diplo editorial staff at h-diplo@h-net.msu.edu.