

# 2019

## H-Diplo

[@HDiplo](#)

Article Review Forum

No. 910

12 December 2019

Editors: Thomas Maddux and Diane Labrosse  
Web and Production Editor: George Fujii

**“Christianity, Gender, and the Language of the World.”** *Journal of American-East Asian Relations* 24:4 (2017): 305-403.

Reviewed by:

Sarah Griffiths, Queens University, North Carolina

Melani McAlister, George Washington University

John Stanley, Kurtztown University

Dong Wang, Shanghai University

<https://hdiplo.org/to/AR910>

Introduction by **Thomas Maddux**, California State University, Northridge, Emeritus

---

Studies of the role of Christian missionaries, both American and foreign, have proliferated since Jane Hunter published *The Gospel of Gentility: American Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the Century China* in 1989.<sup>1</sup> Hunter provides an excellent introduction to the three articles under review in this forum, in particular when she emphasizes the shifting perspectives in studies of women missionaries serving out of Western empires in which race, empire, and nation have been privileged as analytic categories over faith.

Hunter and the three reviewers are very impressed with the articles in the forum by Connie Shemo, Amanda Izzo, and Noriko Ishii. They “provide fine-grained analysis of members of Christian communities from both sides of the missionary exchange—those traveling to the Far and Near East to missionize, those born in Christian communities in Asia, those who converted to Christianity and changed their lives as a result, and those who simply saw opportunities in the Christian presence and took them.”<sup>2</sup> Hunter also emphasizes the importance of the authors’ embedding “their studies in the important and telling details of particular place

---

<sup>1</sup> See Jane Hunter, *The Gospel of Gentility: American Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the Century China* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989). See also H-Diplo Article Review 888 by Karen Garner on “From Gender Constructions to Global State Power Relations, It’s Not Such a Great Leap,” *Diplomatic History* 43:2 (April 2019): 237-304, <https://hdiplo.org/to/AR888>, which focuses on women missionaries in the 1920s, and H-Diplo Roundtable XXI-11 on Melani McAlister’s *The Kingdom of God Has No Borders: A Global History of American Evangelicals* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2018), <https://hdiplo.org/to/RT21-11>, which focuses on the post-1960 period.

<sup>2</sup> Jane Hunter, “Introduction: “Christianity, Gender, and the Language of the World,” 306.

and time and [the fact that ] they show how that detail shaded or burnished the meaning of the Christian presence in Asia.” They also reveal that the “variety of circumstances on the ground contributed to richly different responses among participants, a range of reactions from relevant states, and an important lesson that eventually came back to congregations in the United States.” (306-307)

Sarah Griffith notes that the nation state and American and western imperialism influenced the female missionary movements, as is discussed in Izzo and Connie Shemo’s articles. However, both authors reveal their missionaries to have been functioning as transnational actors interacting with, in Shemo’s study, Chinese women at the Hackett Medical College for Women in China in an evolving relationship, and, in Izzo’s article, Michi Kawai, the Japanese YMCA National Secretary, who resisted the efforts of the American YMCA to intervene with her Japanese staff.<sup>3</sup> Griffith also emphasizes Ishii’s study of Charlotte DeForest and her student Takeda Kiyoko, which explores their difficult efforts to “promote cosmopolitanism, interracial cooperation, and international dialogue” during the increasingly difficult period of Japanese-U.S. diplomatic relations from the late 1920s through World War II.<sup>4</sup>

John Stanley, Dong Wang and Melani McAlister agree with Griffith’s favorable assessments of the three articles. Stanley, for example, approves of Shemo’s engagement with the expanding role of the Chinese female medical practitioners in their work with the U.S. missionaries and Izzo’s treatment of the YMCA’s relations with Kawai in Japan and the missionaries in Turkey, who had to play down their Christian religious purposes and ultimately in 1925 changed their name to the American Girl’s Service Center. Dong Wang endorses the emphasis of the three articles on Christian cosmopolitanism, especially in Ishii’s study of DeForest and Takeda as they resisted “Western imperialism and Japanese militarism through theological and ethnic reconciliation and humanitarian work.” Melani McAlister emphasizes how the three essays confirm the current historiography on missions and demonstrate “first, that white American Christian women operating on the global stage, whether as missionaries or YWCA officials, did not have a single tendency—they were neither uniformly pluralist and cosmopolitan nor inherently imperialist and imperious. Second, that the choices made by the missionaries were, of course, deeply influenced by the imperial context in which they operated and the patronizing assumptions of white American power in their era, but they were, of necessity, involved in a complex set of negotiations that took place in a changing context of anti-imperial assertiveness on the part of women in Japan, China and Turkey.”

The reviewers have a few reservations about the articles. Stanley, for example, points to the challenge of “finding sources from the local population” as the “articles by Shemo and Izzo are good examples of the reliance on western sources” although Stanley notes that Ishii had access to the oral history records of Takeda Kiyoko and Takeda’s original publications. “The problem of evidence when looking at indigenous Christian leaders, particularly female leaders in mission institutions and Christianity at the local level,” Stanley suggests, “is highly problematic.” Wang questions Izzo’s treatment of a comparison on the transfer of leadership in

---

<sup>3</sup> Connie Shemo, “‘Her Chinese Attended to Almost Everything’: Relationships of Power in the Hackett Medical College for Women, Guangzhou, China, 1901–1915,” 321-346; Amanda Izzo, “‘By Love, Serve One Another’: Foreign Mission and the Challenge of World Fellowship in the YWCAs of Japan and Turkey,” 347-372; Noriko Ishii, “Difficult Conversations across Religions, Race and Empires: American Women Missionaries and Japanese Christian Women during the 1930s and 1940s,” 371-403.

<sup>4</sup> Ishii, “Difficult Conversations across Religions, Race and Empires.”

## H-Diplo Article Review

Japan to Kawai with the YMCA in Turkey's move to secularization. Like Stanley, Wang would have welcomed more discussions by Japanese and Turkish women in their own language rather than having them presented "through the medium of missionary agency."

### Participants:

**Sarah Griffith** (Ph.D., University of California, Santa Barbara) is the author of *Asian American Civil Rights: Liberal Protestant Activism, 1900-1950* (University of Illinois Press, March 2018). An Associate Professor at Queens University in Charlotte, NC, Griffith teaches courses on mid to late-19th and 20th-century United States history with specializations in comparative race and ethnic studies, Asian American studies, and Pacific Rim transnationalisms.

**Melani McAlister** teaches American Studies and International Affairs at George Washington University in Washington, DC. A scholar of the US in the World, transnational religion, and cultural history, she has recently completed *The Kingdom of God Has No Borders: A Global History of American Evangelicals*, an expansive study of evangelical internationalism since 1960, forthcoming in August 2018 from Oxford University Press. She is also co-editor of volume 4 of the *Cambridge History of America and the World* (expected 2020). Her other books are *Epic Encounters: Culture, Media, and US Interests in the Middle East* (Univ. of California, 2005, 2001), and *Religion and Politics in the Contemporary United States* (2008), co-edited with R. Marie Griffith. Her Twitter handle is @MelaniMcA.

**Dr. John Stanley** is originally from the Philadelphia area and currently holds the position of Associate Professor in the History Department of Kutztown University. He earned his BA from Moravian College in 1994 and later earned his Masters and Ph.D. from the School of Oriental and African Studies (University of London). The focus of Dr. Stanley's work is on the secular activities of missionaries in China. He has published articles on mission schools and medical work of the American Presbyterians in Shandong from the late-nineteenth to the early-twentieth century.

**Dong Wang** is distinguished university professor of history and director of the Wellington Koo Institute for Modern China in World History at Shanghai University, and research associate at the Fairbank Center of Harvard University since 2002. A director of a 2014-15 NEH seminar program, Dr. Wang currently serves on the editorial board of the Association for Asian Studies (U.S.), *American Foreign Relations Since 1600: A Guide to the Literature* (U.S.), the *Journal of American-East Asian Relations* (U.S. and the Netherlands), *China Information* (Britain), *Twentieth-Century China* (U.S.), the *Journal of Current Chinese Affairs* (Germany), and of *Zongjiao yu Meiguo shehui* (Religion and American society, Fudan University). Books in English that she single-authored include *China's Unequal Treaties: Narrating National History* (2005), *Managing God's Higher Learning: U.S.-China Cultural Encounter and Canton Christian College (Lingnan University), 1888-1952* (2007), and *The United States and China: A History from the Eighteenth Century to the Present* (2013). She has edited *Christianity as an Issue in the History of United States-China Relations* (a special volume of the *Journal of American-East Asian Relations*, 2008) and "The United States, Asia, and the Pacific, 1815-1919," which appeared in *The SHAFR Guide: An Annotated Bibliography of American Foreign Relations since 1600* (2017). Her new book manuscript in English focuses on UNESCO's world heritage site, the Buddhist Longmen Grottoes, as a window on modern Chinese and global politics, culture, and history.

Review by Sarah Griffith, Queens University of Charlotte

---

In 1989, Jane Hunter published *The Gospel of Gentility: American Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the-Century China*.<sup>1</sup> It was among the first books to critically examine the daily lives of American missionary women abroad and stood out for its subtle treatment of the impact of American nationalism, Christian gentility, and Victorian ‘womanliness’ on female missionary enterprises. Mining the diaries, letters, and memoirs of missionary women, Hunter gave readers insight into the tensions that single and married missionary women experienced as they struggled to balance their responsibility to family and faith. Hunter concluded that, while the intimacy of their missionary contacts with Chinese women differed from those of missionary men, American missionary women nonetheless shared with their male counterparts “a sense of the limitless reaches of their authority” and carried with them a broad mandate to “conquer China for Christ” (228-229).

The *Gospel of Gentility* remains a landmark in the field, so it makes sense that Hunter would write the introduction that frames this 2017 special edition of the *Journal of American-East Asian Relations*.<sup>2</sup> A lot has changed in the field since 1989: efforts to internationalize American history have broadened the way historians think about the movement of people and ideas; the incorporation of non-English language archival sources expanded the range of cultural perspectives; gender analysis, and a focus on the role missionary women played in American empire building, have complicated the way we think about U.S. foreign relations. Even so, Hunter notes in her introduction, the nation-state remains a prevailing theme in studies of missionary history. This is particularly the case among critics of cultural imperialism, who have tended to frame missionary history around the nation and race at the expense of closer analyses of the religious and spiritual motivations that drove men and women to serve missions abroad.

The authors included in the 2017 special edition of the *JAEAR* do not disregard the impact of American empire and Western imperialism on the internationalization of female missionary movements of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Amanda Izzo, for instance, acknowledges at the outset of her article that when the World Young Women’s Christian Association was founded in 1894 it took as its motto the Old Testament verse “not by might, nor by power, but my spirit, saith the Lord,” thus evoking the millennial impetus driving American foreign missions eager to see the coming of the Kingdom of God on Earth.<sup>3</sup> The American medical missionaries at the center of Connie Shemo’s research were beneficiaries of unequal treaties forced on China by European imperialists as early as the 1840s.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Jane Hunter, *The Gospel of Gentility: American Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the-Century China* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989).

<sup>2</sup> Hunter, “Introduction: ‘Christianity, Gender, and the Language of the World,’” *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 305-320.

<sup>3</sup> Amanda Izzo, “‘By Love, Serve One Another’: Foreign Mission and the Challenge of World Fellowship in the YWCAs of Japan and Turkey,” *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 347-372, here 348.

<sup>4</sup> Connie Shemo, “‘Her Chinese Attended to Almost Everything’: Relationships of Power in the Hackett Medical College for Women, Guangzhou, China, 1901–1915,” *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 321-346.

Engaging with the realities of imperialism is unavoidable in the study of missionaries. As Ian Tyrell has observed, with the expansion of U.S. imperialism in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, American missionaries and moral reformers undertook work at an unprecedented rate and scale.<sup>5</sup> However, to position the nation state as the central actor driving foreign missions is to miss the more nuanced forces that shaped, and re-shaped, American missionaries across the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The authors in the special edition seek to remedy some of the imbalance by looking to the local conditions and contexts in which missionary women worked. As transnational actors, missionary women developed unique worldviews that often tested their allegiance to their home countries, and sometimes their adopted ones as well. In addressing what Hunter calls “an increasingly secular, sinful, and war-mongering world” (306), American and non-American missionaries adapted their methods and goals to respond to shifting national and international geo-politics.

Shemo’s research on the American Presbyterian Hackett Medical College for Women in Guangzhou, China challenges the notion that American missionary women merely imposed Western religion and scientific ideas on unsuspecting Chinese subjects. Chinese women had been practicing healing techniques since at least the 1840s. The American missionary women who arrived in the late nineteenth century brought with them new techniques, like surgery and gynecology, new titles like ‘physician’ that brought greater prestige, and new policies on admissions that expanded the range of women practicing medicine to include single and non-elite women. Chinese women viewed their association with the Hackett Medical College through pragmatic lenses – Western medical training offered them the opportunity for self-support – and contrary to American missionary reports, they came to exercise greater control over decisions made at the institution. Shemo’s study of annual reports and missionary memoirs reveals not only that Chinese women did most of the medical work at the college but they also expected American women physicians to ‘consult’ with them prior to admitting new teachers to the program. Shemo’s exploration of the traditions of female healers in Guangzhou and the relationships of power that evolved over the early 1900s challenges imperialist narratives that portrayed non-Western cultures in need of rescue.

Izzo’s research considers the ways in which both local conditions and indigenous women challenged and shaped American missionary projects in diverse geographies. The memoirs of Japanese YWCA National Secretary Michi Kawai illuminate the impact indigenous women had on American missionary efforts abroad. Kawai leveraged her access to female factory workers to advance the goals of the YWCA across the early twentieth century, but her administrative style, raised the ire of American YWCA officials. When Kawai rejected offers by the American YWCA to send assistants to staff the organization, she was accused of ‘anti-foreign’ sentiments. Her unwillingness to view Western stewardship as beneficial challenged the sensibilities of U.S. administrators just as debates over indigenization of foreign missions were at their height. Ultimately, Kawai’s success as an administrator, her ability to secure a Japanese staff, and her exit from the YWCA in 1926 after administrators had pinned her as leading the association in perpetuity all served to thwart American leaders’ desires to make heavy handed interventions in the organization (360).

Association records and missionary publications indicate that the American YWCA faced a different set of challenges in Turkey following anti-colonial movements in the 1920s that gave rise to the Turkish nation. National secularization and modernization had fueled revolutionary zeal, and American YWCA secretaries

---

<sup>5</sup> Ian Tyrell, *Reforming the World: The Creation of America’s Moral Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, reprint 2013).

responded by adopting secular activities and services that appealed to both Christian and Muslim women. This interfaith spirit appeased Turkish government officials but raised consternation among World YWCA officials who maintained a commitment to evangelize along strict lines of Christianity. As Izzo suggests, the adaptations of American women challenges overly simplistic narratives that presume unidirectional power relationships in missionary work (348). By realizing a more global vision of Christianity, the American staff in Turkey provided the foundation for transnational institutional partnerships that lasted into the post-WWII era.

Across the twentieth century, women missionaries struggled to understand the role Christianity played in an increasingly divided world. Noriko Ishii's study of Japan-born missionary Charlotte B. DeForest and her student Takeda Kiyoko show how women sought to reconcile Japanese patriotic nationalism and American racism with their Christian faith during the 1930s and 1940s.<sup>6</sup> Born in Osaka to missionary parents in 1879, DeForest served as president of Kobe College through the 1920s and 1930s. After being pressured by the Japanese government to promote state Shintoism, DeForest responded by developing a hybrid understanding of Christian teachings and Japanese religious beliefs. Upon her return to the United States in the early 1940s DeForest served as an interpreter for Japanese Americans interned at various camps across the U.S. West. Her interactions with visiting Japanese scholar Yuasa Hachiro inspired DeForest to imagine a new, multinational vision of Christian ecumenism that had the potential to transcend race, state, and religious difference (388).

DeForest passed her vision of Christian cosmopolitanism to her student, Takeda Kiyoko, who converted to Christianity in 1938. As chairwoman of the National Student YWCA, Takeda was criticized during the 1939 World YWCA meeting in Amsterdam for her association with the Japanese nation-state and targeted by the Japanese government upon her return home in the early 1940s. Takeda navigated her Christian identity in wartime Japan with both trepidation and pragmatism. After years of living abroad, she struggled to understand the silence of her countrymen and women, whom she referred to as "humans in shells" (396). Over the war, Takeda came to understand silence as a coping mechanism adopted by a war-weary society. Both women remained true to their Christian faith, even as Japan and the United States demanded conformity to wartime notions of patriotism. This is in keeping with Hunter's assertion that religion is important because "in its pure form it summons ideas that extend beyond the temporal and earthbound" (306). In the decades that followed, DeForest and Takeda established the Asian Cultural Committee, where they undertook research on the impact of Christianity on Asian cultures. Their efforts to promote cosmopolitanism, interracial cooperation, and international dialogue served as testaments to the unique worldviews and deep religious faith many women missionaries possessed.

The articles collected in this special edition of the *JAPEAR* add to a growing body of scholarship that seeks to challenge more simplistic understandings of missionary history. Karen K. Seat's study of women missionaries in Japan shows that women played a crucial role in shaping foreign perceptions of the United States across the late nineteenth century.<sup>7</sup> At the same time, these women were not mere pawns of the nation state. In establishing progressive schools for girls, they defied conservatives both within their denominations as well as

---

<sup>6</sup> Noriko Ishii, "Difficult Conversations across Religions, Race and Empires: American Women Missionaries and Japanese Christian Women during the 1930s and 1940s," *JAPEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 371-403.

<sup>7</sup> Karen S. Seat, *Providence has Freed our Hands: Women's Missions and the American Encounter with Japan* (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2008).

those in the government of Japan. Elizabeth Dorn Lublin notes similar contestations over power in her study of the Women's Christian Temperance Union (WCTU).<sup>8</sup> Through the WCTU, American and Japanese women debated the very meaning of 'modernity' and considered the role women would play in Japan's transformation into a Pacific power. Motoe Sasaki's research on American and Chinese 'New Women' reveals the subjectivity of modern progress over the first half of the twentieth century.<sup>9</sup> While American missionary women were at first welcomed as harbingers of enlightened education, the favorable attitude toward them would not last. Disillusioned by Wilsonian principles of self-determination and the Chinese government's inability to negotiate beneficial terms for China in the aftermath of the First World War, reform-minded Chinese women and men began looking to the Soviet Union and international communism to guide national salvation. The incorporation of non-English language sources such as those cited in Ishii's article have likewise contributed to a more well-rounded understanding of this history. Hearing the voices of women on the receiving end of American missionary enterprises changes the way we think about relationships of power, the adaptive nature of women's missions, and the role religion and spiritual belief played in women's lives across the twentieth century.

---

<sup>8</sup> Elizabeth Dorn Lublin, *The Women's Christian Temperance Union in the Meiji Period* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2010).

<sup>9</sup> Motoe Sasaki, *Redemption and Revolution: American and Chinese New Women in the Early Twentieth Century* (Cornell: Cornell University Press, 2016).

Review by **Melani McAlister**, George Washington University

---

These three essays explore the ways in which women in China, Japan, and Turkey encountered U.S. Christian missionaries in the early part of the twentieth century; how Asian women navigated power dynamics and forged relationships, and how they shaped the institutions of Christianity in those countries into their own image. All three pieces participate in the now long-standing critique of the historiography of missions. That critique argues that scholarship that once simply celebrated missionary benevolence (coming, as it did, out of Christian colleges and/or neocolonial perspectives) turned in the 1980s to an overly one-sided criticism of missionaries as primarily or solely representatives of empire (the latter is exemplified, in the best sense, in John and Jean Comaroff's remarkable work on South Africa).<sup>1</sup>

Scholars in the last fifteen or so years have argued that missionary work is a process of negotiation and navigation in which the 'missionized' are active co-constructors of meaning. This is not just a matter of resistance, in which agency is limited to resisting colonialism to various degrees, but a matter of seeing Christian conversion as one step in a long process of encounter. From Ussama Makdisi's work on nineteenth century Lebanon to Kevin O'Neill's writing on contemporary Guatemala or Ebenezer Obadare's or Ruth Marshall's work on Nigeria, this mode of narrating the missionary encounter has provided a rich vein for understanding the politics of religion.<sup>2</sup>

This selection of essays from *The Journal of East Asian Relations* participates in this conversation in a very useful way, showing us how different groups of Asian women navigated their own position in institutions run by American (or American and European) missionaries. What the pieces show in concert are: first, that white American Christian women operating on the global stage, whether as missionaries or YWCA officials, did not have a single tendency – they were neither uniformly pluralist and cosmopolitan nor inherently imperialist and imperious. Second, that the choices made by missionaries were, of course, deeply influenced by the imperial context in which they operated and the patronizing assumptions of white American power in their era, but they were, of necessity, involved in a complex set of negotiations that took place in a changing context of anti-imperial assertiveness on the part of women in Japan, China, and Turkey. As David Hollinger has recently shown, those experiences abroad often shaped how US missionaries advocated for transnational

---

<sup>1</sup> Jean Comaroff and John L. Comaroff, *Of Revelation and Revolution, Volume 1: Christianity, Colonialism, and Consciousness in South Africa*, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., vol. 1, 2 vols. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991); Jean Comaroff and John L. Comaroff, *Of Revelation and Revolution, Volume 2: The Dialectics of Modernity on a South African Frontier*, vol. 1, 2 vols. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991). There is a great deal of excellent discussion of the historiography of missions. One I find particularly useful is the introduction to Heather J. Sharkey, *American Evangelicals in Egypt: Missionary Encounters in an Age of Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008).

<sup>2</sup> Ussama Makdisi, *Artillery of Heaven: American Missionaries and the Failed Conversion of the Middle East* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2008); Kevin Lewis O'Neill, *City of God: Christian Citizenship in Postwar Guatemala* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009); Ruth Marshall, *Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009); Ebenezer Obadare, *Pentecostal Republic: Religion and the Struggle for State Power in Nigeria* (London: Zed Books, 2018). See also Paul S. Landau, *The Realm of the Word: Language, Gender, and Christianity in a Southern African Kingdom* (London: J. Currey, 1995); Emily Conroy-Krutz, *Christian Imperialism: Converting the World in the Early American Republic*, 1<sup>st</sup> ed. (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2015).

awareness on their return to the US.<sup>3</sup> And third, that these negotiations provided opportunities—or sometimes requirements—for transforming imperial power dynamics. Those opportunities were not always taken, and the negotiations were successful to varying degrees, but missionary relations were vectors of change.

The first of the three essays, by Connie Shemo, offers a fascinating narrative about a 1915 crisis at the American Presbyterian Hackett Medical College for Women in Guangzhou, China.<sup>4</sup> Chinese women had been trained as medical practitioners at this college for a number of years, working on an apprenticeship model. An American woman missionary doctor, Mary Fulton, was the director of the college, but Shemo argues that, by the time two younger American women missionaries arrived in 1913, the college was actually run by Fulton's Chinese 'assistants.' The crisis occurred over the question of what constituted an appropriate form of medical education, with the new missionaries pushing for more modern and scientific methods.

Shemo's article is exciting in part because she brings the history of medicine and the history of education into conversation with missions, giving all of them central place in the history of empire. This connects to important new directions of work in environmental history and the study of biopolitics.<sup>5</sup> Drawing on the history of medicine in both China and the U.S., she shows how women's status mattered—being a physician, particularly one who worked with women and childbirth, was relatively low status in turn-of-the-century China, but the idea of training Chinese women in Western medical techniques also fit in well with Chinese reformers' ideas about developing a healthy nation better able to resist imperialism. After the Boxer Uprising in 1900, "Chinese elites became more concerned with adopting Western ideas of 'hygiene' to achieve a strong, modern nation able to resist imperialism (334)."

This led to success in establishing the college for women, but the appeal of Western-style education had its limits. Shemo had to look carefully at a limited archival record to try to assess what was happening at the college, but she convincingly argues that, by the time the younger American women arrived with their ideas about teaching a more scientific kind of medical practice—one based more on formal education and less on apprenticeship—they faced significant resistance from the Chinese women who were actually running Hackett Medical College. Although donors in the U.S. were told that the missionaries were fully in charge, the facts seem to have been otherwise, and the Americans who wanted changes (including the Rockefeller Foundation, which did a major report on medical education in China in 1914-15) faced a group of Chinese women who had been trained at the Hackett, who now worked there as instructors and 'assistants,' and who were unwilling to see their methods (and their livelihoods) challenged. Rockefeller reported that the education

---

<sup>3</sup> David A Hollinger, *Protestants Abroad: How Missionaries Tried to Change the World But Changed America* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2017).

<sup>4</sup> Connie Shemo, "'Her Chinese Attended to Almost Everything': Relationships of Power in the Hackett Medical College for Women, Guangzhou, China, 1901–1915," *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 321-346.

<sup>5</sup> Among the many valuable books in this field, see Neel Ahuja, *Bioinsecurities: Disease Interventions, Empire, and the Government of Species* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2016); Warwick Anderson, *Colonial Pathologies: American Tropical Medicine, Race, and Hygiene in the Philippines* (Durham: Duke University Press Books, 2006); Johanna Tayloe Crane, *Scrambling for Africa AIDS, Expertise, and the Rise of American Global Health Science* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 2013); Marcos Cueto, *Cold War, Deadly Fevers: Malaria Eradication in Mexico, 1955-1975*, 1<sup>st</sup> ed. (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2007).

was “of a low grade” that “hardly warrants” their practicing general medicine (338), but the Chinese women insisted to the Americans that they should be consulted on any reforms.

This is not, however, a story of victorious resistance. Although the two American missionaries who ran the Hackett Medical School after 1915 stopped complaining about the behavior of the Chinese assistants, the reason for the end of the complaints is not clear. It is possible that most of the Chinese women left, or that they simply lost their battle for control, as the medical landscape in China became more professionalized. But those same changes also began to undermine the system of separate medical schools for women. The two American missionaries resigned in 1923, and by the early 1930s, the school was fully co-educational, managed entirely by Chinese and also entirely by men. Modern American scientific methods in medical education were indeed adopted, but both American and Chinese women lost power in the process.

Amanda Izzo’s compelling article considers the complex negotiations undertaken by the global YWCA movement in the early twentieth century, looking specifically at the cases of Japan and Turkey.<sup>6</sup> These two examples are particularly intriguing because they indicate very different directions for the organization in two specific circumstances, one (Japan) where the Christian nature of the YWCA was and remained central to the transnational negotiations among its leaders, and another (Turkey) where an explicitly Christian identity simply became impossible in the context of nationalist self-assertion. In both cases, the YWCA’s work proceeded from the imperial roots of the foreign missions movement, but, by the 1920s, Izzo argues, “challenges from Asian YWCAs to ethnocentric models of foreign missions produced a radically revised conception of the meaning of evangelization and international outreach” (349). One of the most interesting aspects of Izzo’s approach is that she brings together YWCA activity in two countries that are generally part of different area studies historiographies, showing both continuities and distinctiveness across East Asia and Southwest Asia. Of the three articles, this one is perhaps the most critical of the presumptiveness of American and European women, who often claimed to be impressed by Asian women’s agency while also subtly working to undermine it.

The story in Japan centers primarily around one woman, Michi Kawai, who became the first Japanese woman to serve as the executive director of the YWCA in Japan. Born in Ise, the daughter of a Shinto priest, Kawai was educated at Bryn Mawr College. A devout Protestant and an advocate of Westernization in Japan, she was nonetheless determined that the YWCA’s work in Japan should be led by Japanese. Like many missionary institutions, the YWCA often found that the logic of indigenization, which the group theoretically supported, provided the devil in the details. In this case, as in other missionary enterprises, the issue was finances. The global organization wanted to pay for foreign workers but not for local ones, which Kawai resisted, not wanting local staff to be outnumbered by foreign workers. Izzo tells a complex story of how Kawai navigated the politics of such relationships, and how at the same time she pushed the international women’s missionary movement to think about larger political issues. Speaking to a national meeting of the U.S. YWCA in 1920, Kawai asked the American women to turn back their hats and look at the silk linings. “Our women are making that silk,” Kawai told the Americans, “working thirteen hours a day” (360). Instead of asking for uplift, Kawai asked for Americans to consider their own role in perpetuating injustice.

---

<sup>6</sup> Amanda Izzo, “‘By Love, Serve One Another’: Foreign Mission and the Challenge of World Fellowship in the YWCAs of Japan and Turkey,” *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 347-372.

Izzo's discussion of the Turkish case is briefer but no less interesting, as she unpacks the ways that the U.S. YWCA—which was 'responsible' for work in Turkey in a division that mirrored aspects of the mandate system—negotiated the Kemalist revolution. The YWCA in Turkey had always had an impressive mix of religious adherents among those it served: In 1924 Istanbul officials recorded 26 nationalities and eight religious creeds among the YWCA's program participants. But in the context of increasing nationalism and a rising resentment against Christian missionizing, the organization quickly evolved, eschewing all proselytism. The director assured Turks that "we are not interested in criticizing Islam" (366) and the group registered in 1925 with a new name, as the American Girls' Service Center.

While this name change and the focus on social services fit with the larger trends in liberal Protestantism, which evolved away from evangelism over the course of the twentieth century, it did not initially sit well with the World YWCA, which distanced itself from Istanbul for a number of years—until the global YWCA movement itself began to affirm a more social-service oriented agenda after World War II. As Izzo concludes, U.S. and European women "once envisioned the internationalization of the YWCA through the distortive lens of an orientalist women's evangelism," but, over time, "women in missionary-receiving countries ably took over the leadership of their associations and proposed their own plans for the movement" (370).

Like the other two essays, Noriko Ishii's insightful and elegantly argued piece examines the tensions that undergirded Christian women's insistence that, among the faithful, "there is neither Jew nor Greek" (Gal 3:28).<sup>7</sup> Focused on Japan from the 1920s to the 1940s, a period of increasing international tension and the realities of war, the essay highlights how national and racial politics were never far from the surface. And yet Ishii, like the other authors in this group, shows that a conviction about sisterhood in Christ did fuel the possibility of what Ishii, following Kris Manjapra, calls "aspirational cosmopolitanism."<sup>8</sup> Ishii's essay describes the relationships forged by two women in Japan: an American missionary and the president of Kobe College, Charlotte DeForest, and her Japanese student, Takeda Kiyoko. Ishii describes the thorny problems that DeForest faced in the 1920s and 1930s as the rise of state Shintoism meant that she had to navigate new social norms and sometimes laws that required her Christian students to visit ancestral shrines. DeForest declared that shrine visitation was about patriotism and not religion, thus threading a needle that allowed her students to carry out nationalist duties in a situation in which Christians were already under suspicion.

As tensions increased and the Sino-Japanese war broke out, Takeda, still a student at Kobe College, faced a number of reckonings. She chose to be baptized in 1938, at a time when many Japanese saw Christianity as a threat to the nation, and a month later Takeda was elected president of the national student YWCA. She was sent as Japan's representative to a YWCA meeting in Amsterdam in 1939. But what Takeda learned on that trip was not only how it felt to navigate Western women's sense of superiority but also what it meant to travel through the world as a representative of Japan, which many people saw as an aggressive and militaristic nation. Traveling to Shanghai, Takeda was taken by Chinese YWCA representatives to Nanjing, site of the Japanese massacre in 1937. When she arrived in Amsterdam, Takeda encountered a number of women who simply hated Japan. Having grown up with little information about how the rest of the world saw Japanese

---

<sup>7</sup> Noriko Ishii, "Difficult Conversations across Religions, Race and Empires: American Women Missionaries and Japanese Christian Women during the 1930s and 1940s," *JAPEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 371-403.

<sup>8</sup> S. Bose and K. Manjapra, eds., *Cosmopolitan Thought Zones: South Asia and the Global Circulation of Ideas*, 2010 edition (Houndmills and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010).

## H-Diplo *Article Review*

military actions in China, she was shocked. She realized that she needed to try to understand how other women viewed her homeland. “As a delegate from a widely hated country,” Ishii writes, Takeda “decided it was necessary to challenge imagination through difference to craft a Japanese Christianity that could deal with the social reality of war” (393).

After the Amsterdam conference, Takeda went to the U.S. to study as an exchange student at Olivet College in Michigan. From there she went on to study with Reinhold Niebuhr at Union Theological Seminary. During this time, Charlotte DeForest had come back to the U.S. on furlough. When war broke out in 1941, DeForest could not return to Japan, and ended up working as a translator for Japanese in the U.S. who were interned; she also taught Japanese to U.S. soldiers going to Japan. Mostly, DeForest wanted nothing to do with the war effort, and felt anxious to ameliorate the situation of Japanese in the United States.

Takeda was also caught in the U.S. by the start of the war, still a student at Union. Niebuhr offered to be her guarantor if she wanted to stay in the U.S., but she decided to return home. There, she found herself, like DeForest, at odds with her fellow citizens’ enthusiasm for war. Still working for the YWCA, she tried to find a way to criticize her country’s policies while remaining affirmatively committed to her Japanese identity. As Ishii concludes, both DeForest and Takeda were committed to a faith that they believed could transcend nationalism. “The visions they created during the 1930s and 1940s...manifested some differences in focus, but they shared the ultimate goal to craft aspirational cosmopolitanism rooted in Christian faith” (396).

The belief that Christianity could provide a meaningful form of transnational affiliation for women was central to most of the women’s activism described in these essays. None of the women activists were able to fully transcend the realities of western imperial presumption, racial hierarchy, war-related crises, and gender oppression that they all faced. Instead, they worked to navigate the world as they found it, moving in directions that their faith and transnational networks made possible. In each case, American and European missionary women found themselves changed by the reality that the women they worked with, whether in China, Japan, or Turkey, were not inclined to simply accept Western women’s authority. Instead, they were determined to shape the faith and the institutions they had made their own.

Review by **John R. Stanley**, Kutztown University

---

The articles in this issue focus the reader's attention on the relationship between western missionaries and the societies in which they work. All three of the articles weave an interesting tale of the experiences of Christian women in East Asia and Turkey. Just as important as their focus on the female experience is their questioning of the western-impact approach. They also show local women as agents of change rather than passive receivers of culture in the story of missionary work. The inclusion of the female experience, particularly from the local society, contributes considerably to our understanding of the important role that the local population played in this history. In the introductory article, Jane Hunter begins to separate the female experience, noting that female missionaries differed from the male missionaries of the time.<sup>1</sup> Hunter proceeds to argue that mission scholars must treat the missionaries' motives individually rather than using broad generalizations about missionary motivations for engaging in such work. This is particularly true for the influence of the nation in motivating women to travel overseas. Expanding this view of the missionary movement, Hunter notes that time and place play a key role in the varied responses of the participants that one sees in each article. Each of these articles fits well into the interaction and the place/time themes that Hunter notes in her introduction.

Connie Shemo's article challenges the missionary-impact approach and focuses on the influence of Chinese female medical practitioners in the curriculum of the Hackett Medical College.<sup>2</sup> Her article also shows the relationship between missionary institutions and the new opportunities they offered to single Chinese women. Shemo first examines the motivation of female missionaries to engage in overseas work through the story of Martha Hackett and her inspiration from the stories of the "medical distress of Chinese women" told by Dr. Mary Fulton during her furloughs in the United States (322). Shemo also notes that Hackett was inspired to bring a more scientific form of medical education to Chinese women as opposed to imperialist impulses that are normally attached to the missionary movement. The desire to introduce a more scientific form of medicine was common to new doctors sent by mission societies and is specifically focused on by the Rockefeller Foundation in the 1910s. Hackett, however, was more than a medical college. Like other secular institutions it "provided a road for upward mobility to less elite women without access to much formal education" (338). Within this focus, however, Shemo engages the issue of Chinese agency and control of missionary enterprises. She argues that it was the local Chinese female medical practitioners and not the western missionaries who formulated solutions to Chinese problems which in turn expanded the work of the Hackett. This is an important element of the work of the missionaries, and studies focusing on female missionaries and the work of Chinese women in the field have emerged recently.<sup>3</sup> However, in the primary source material, female teachers or medical assistants are not given much space. Shemo's introduction of the

---

<sup>1</sup> Jane Hunter, "Introduction: 'Christianity, Gender, and the Language of the World,'" *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 305-320.

<sup>2</sup> Connie Shemo, "'Her Chinese Attended to Almost Everything': Relationships of Power in the Hackett Medical College for Women, Guangzhou, China, 1901-1915," *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 321-346.

<sup>3</sup> Dan Bays's edited work *Christianity in China* contains a section on Chinese women with articles by Heidi Ross and Pui-lan Kwok. Dan Bays. *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present*. (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996). See also Ellen Xiang-Yu Cai, "The First Group of Chaoshan Biblewomen," in Joseph Lee, ed., *Christianizing South China: Mission, Development, and Identity in Modern Chaoshan*. (Cham: Palgrave MacMillan, 2018), 15-36.

female medical practitioners provides a significant advance in our understanding of the influence that Chinese women had in formulating mission policy. The theme of time and place is also evident in the article, as the author explains that the influence of Chinese women declined in the hospital after more scientific medicine was required, which led to the rise of male faculty (341).

The second article, by Amanda Izzo, expands on the interaction theme of Shemo's article through the history of the YWCA in Japan and Turkey during periods of growing nationalism.<sup>4</sup> Izzo focuses on the interaction between the missionary-receiving societies and those from the U.S. that sought to expand the YWCA. As she notes "complex negotiations of power at the personal and organizational levels marked the day-to-day administration of YWCAs in missionary-receiving communities in Asia, giving rise, in many instances, to long-term transnational partnerships" (348). The early expansion efforts maintained a system of white western leadership that had always been part of the civilizing impulse of missionaries. The inclusion of Michi Kawai provides an example of a local female leader who set the YWCA on the path toward local control of operations. This caused great conflict within the YWCA, where Kawai was seen as a blessing by some but others, particularly the U.S.-based supporters of the work, did not agree with her work to indigenize the management of the association. The section on Turkey examines the changes in the YWCA that were forced due to rising nationalism in the new nation after 1923. This is a common theme in the history of missions that can be seen throughout the world. It was usually only due to political change that the local population was able to enter true leadership positions. Unlike other areas of the world, in Turkey the YWCA workers began adapting to local conditions early on by referring to their association buildings as community day centers. The rejection of their Christian-focused activities accelerated after 1923 as Islam was elevated as an important element of the Turkish national identity. In the end, the YWCA rejected its religious purpose and became a secular institution, registering as such in 1925 and renamed itself the American Girls' Service Center. Izzo concludes that the changes in the YWCA policies were due to the fact that women in many parts of the world faced similar challenges and that the YWCA allowed women to overcome them through its various local activities. The theme of time and place is clearly evident through the political changes in Japan and Turkey as they related to the impact those changes had on YWCA policies.

The last article by Noriko Ishii focuses on identity with an in-depth look at two women: Charlotte B. DeForest, the last missionary president of Kobe College, and Takeda Kiyoko, a former student of hers and a leader of the YWCA in Japan.<sup>5</sup> The conceptual framework centers on 'aspirational cosmopolitanism' (374). The article specifically argues that "cultural contact in missionary enterprises fostered hybrid understandings of cultures, as war provided momentum for women in mission to consider the relationship between their loyalty to nation and to religion" (374). Since she was raised in Japan in a missionary family, DeForest had the language and cultural background necessary to exist in both worlds, but she was not truly part of either. Coming from the hybrid background allowed her to permit elements of Japanese society to be incorporated into the Kobe College environment. One example that Ishii provides is DeForest's decision to allow the Kobe College students, who were Christian, to attend the Shinto shrines as required by the state. She saw the visits through the lens of student patriotism rather than religious practices. Ishii attributes DeForest's success and

---

<sup>4</sup> Amanda Izzo, "'By Love, Serve One Another': Foreign Mission and the Challenge of World Fellowship in the YWCAs of Japan and Turkey," *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 347-372.

<sup>5</sup> Noriko Ishii, "Difficult Conversations across Religions, Race and Empires: American Women Missionaries and Japanese Christian Women during the 1930s and 1940s," *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 371-403.

the fact that she began this process much earlier to her “hybrid upbringing” in Japan (378). DeForest was once again challenged to choose between different forms of state service after 1941 when she was residing in the United States. Instead of working for the Office of Strategic Services she chose a position interpreting and counseling interned Japanese Americans.

The second half of Ishii’s article focuses on Takeda Kiyoko and her struggles with identity. Takeda was pushed by her mother to expand her education and attend Kobe College, where she received baptism after being influenced by DeForest and the school environment she found. She became the local president of the YWCA and chairman of the National Student YWCA Council. At this time the YWCA was struggling with how to balance its goals of promoting conversions for peace around the world and Japan’s national mobilization policy, which was passed in 1937. She eventually concluded that a Japanese Christianity needed to be crafted to deal with the realities of Japanese society and the atrocities of war that she saw as she traveled around the world. Although this article takes a different approach to the interaction concept through identity, it clearly shows the impact that a Japanese woman could have in a leadership position within the YWCA organization. Like Izzo’s article, it reveals that political developments impacted policies but also forced members of societies to examine their roles in a changing nation.

One of the important questions when one studies mission organizations is finding sources from the local population. A quick scan of the bibliographies shows that the primary and secondary sources display each author’s expertise in the subject matter. In the study of missionary work and the expansion of Christianity it is always a challenge for researchers to find information about local societies since most of the actors did not come from the elite classes and were not directly linked through the leadership to overseas associations. This is particularly true when looking at the lower-level schools and medical facilities which had significant local participation. The articles by Shemo and Izzo are good examples of the reliance on western sources. Shemo, for example, included some of the experiences of the students at the school. She includes the example of Luo Xiuyun, a graduate of and instructor at Hackett, but the information is based upon an account recorded by the missionaries. Most of the women working at Hackett were not officially part of the power structure and, therefore, did not leave letters, diaries, writings, or memoirs in the archives. Ishii, on the other hand, had access to the oral history records of Takeda Kiyoko that were created in 2013 and 2014 and original publications by Takeda. This problem of evidence when looking at indigenous Christian leaders, particularly female leaders, in mission institutions and Christianity at the local level is highly problematic. This is particularly true when the focus is not on leaders of established missionary institutions or associations, as was the case in Shemo’s study.

Many studies of women in the missionary movement have focused on western women. Kathleen Lodwick’s study of Margaret Moninger in Hainan is a good example and other articles have previously been written this subject.<sup>6</sup> However, the studies in this journal issue highlight the importance of including local women rather than just the female missionaries. It is clear from these studies that local women were the important agents of change in the development of mission policies and that the interaction between missionaries and society was a long-established trend in the work of western associations. The issue of time and place noted in Hunter’s introduction is also a theme in the articles by Shemo, Izzo, and Ishii. Whether the article covers changing

---

<sup>6</sup> Kathleen Lodwick. *Educating the Women of Hainan: The Career of Margaret Moninger in China, 1915-1942*. (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1995).

## **H-Diplo** *Article Review*

national political conditions, advances in scientific medicine, or times of national emergency, all three articles include this theme that Hunter refers to in her introductory article.

Review by **Dong Wang**, Shanghai University

---

Composed of three full research papers and introduced by historian Jane Hunter of Lewis & Clark College, this thought-provoking special issue of the *Journal of American-East Asian Relations* adds welcome contributions to the rich scholarship on women missionaries and the manifold connections of American Protestantism with China, Japan, and Turkey during the first half of the twentieth century.

In her opening essay, which is comprehensive for an introduction, Hunter questions the validity of the nation-state master narrative as a conceptual frame for understanding Christian foreign mission and women's overseas volunteering.<sup>1</sup> Do we privilege race over the matter of faith and soul in our academic queries? Is it disloyal to historical truth to cast female missionaries in superior and arrogant roles vis-à-vis oppressed Asian women under the aspect of nations and empires? Is there universal love that can permeate human activities and interactions beyond time, place, and culture in religion and humanity? Assured that this is so, Hunter contributes to the growing recognition in recent scholarship, including my own work on Christianity, of the multidirectional and transcultural influence in the missionary exchange of global and Asian history.

To Hunter, the three articles in this volume, by Connie Shemo, Amanda L. Izzo, and Noriko Ishii of Sophia University, respectively, narrate the practical ecumenical projects at the Hackett Medical College for Women in Canton, China, the YWCAs in Japan and Turkey, and in the extraordinary lives of Charlotte DeForest and Kiyoko Takeda in Japan and the United States. The first two articles highlight power relations, management, and adaptability in overseas Christianity, whereas the third offers an absorbing biography of two Christian female leaders who reconciled and practiced faith through understanding, tolerance, and difference in war times.

Shemo's paper, "'Her Chinese Attended to Almost Everything': Relationships of Power in the Hackett Medical College for Women (the College), Guangzhou, China, 1901-1915," addresses the realities of practical work in South China.<sup>2</sup> Founded by Dr. Mary Fulton in 1899, the College advocated medical education for women, but it was assessed as 'a low grade' institution when Dr. Martha Hackett—a professional physician—the Rockefeller Foundation, and other stakeholders decided to bring to China medical professionalization and tightened requirements in the early twentieth century. On field trips, they discovered that the actual running of the College was left to Fulton's so-called Chinese 'assistants.' Shemo has a knack for delineating how traditional Chinese midwives or female healers became motivated to learn new medical, especially surgical, techniques on their own economic terms. She argues that all these do not fit into the conventional image of American women physician missionaries as either heroines or imperialists. In the end, readers are again confronted with the authenticity of 'native voices,' since nearly all of the article's source materials involve the voices of American women evangelizers, a fact that ultimately compounds the understanding of the power relationship between Chinese 'assistants' and the American missionary agency. It also makes one wonder whether the Hackett situation was an isolated or wide-spread case of management.

---

<sup>1</sup> Jane Hunter, "Introduction: 'Christianity, Gender, and the Language of the World,'" *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 305-320.

<sup>2</sup> Connie Shemo, "'Her Chinese Attended to Almost Everything': Relationships of Power in the Hackett Medical College for Women, Guangzhou, China, 1901-1915," *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 321-346.

In her essay entitled “‘By Love, Serve One Another’: Foreign Mission and the Challenge of World Fellowship in the YWCAs of Japan and Turkey,” Izzo throws light on women’s proselytizing activism and organizational negotiations of power during the first half of the twentieth century.<sup>3</sup> Agreeing with findings from other studies during the last two decades, Izzo argues that the dynamics of more fully materializing a vision of global Christianity “came out of the interactions—sometimes collaborative, sometimes contentious—between YWCA participants in missionary-receiving territories and the architects of international expansion, a group in which U.S. staff figured centrally” (348). Such interactions derived from faith-rooted elements such as the existence of a soul, universal love, and sisterhood that lay the foundation for cross-cultural connections and adaptation in and between Christianity, Buddhism, Islam, Judaism, and other beliefs. On the other hand, the article does not seem to explain why the local executive power transfer of the YWCA of Japan to Michi Kawai, the first Japanese YWCA secretary of YWCA as well as an educator and Christian activist, is studied in conjunction with the YWCA Turkey’s adjustment of its proselytizing tactics to war relief, social gospel, and secularization due to the entrenched presence of Islam. In the article’s discussion of the American missionary discourse about Japan, Kawai’s are taken at face value, while those of another protagonist, Charlotte Adams, a high-ranking secretary in the U.S. association, are not. Furthermore, it would have been helpful if Japanese and Turkish women’s viewpoints as expressed in their own languages had been taken into account rather than through the medium of missionary agency.

The theme issue ends with a theoretically guided, empirically solid article by Ishii, “Difficult Conversations across Religious, Race and Empires: American Women Missionaries and Japanese Christian Women during the 1930s and 1940s.”<sup>4</sup> Ishii employs the conception of aspirational cosmopolitanism through a biographical case study of two interrelated Christians on both sides of the Pacific, Charlotte B. DeForest—born in Japan to an American missionary family and president (1915-1940) of Kobe College—and her Japanese converter, Kiyoko Takeda (Cho), a Christian intellectual who was committed to peace and reconciliation. When Japan invaded the Asian continent, and when the two nations, Japan and the United States, were at war after the Pearl Harbor, DeForest and Takeda found themselves in the crossfire of moral anguish, religious loyalty and patriotic duties. Their ecumenical understanding of other variant cultures, languages, and societies lifted them to transcend race, nation-states and to embrace a common zone of human allegiance. Both were able to silently resist Western imperialism and Japanese militarism through theological and ethic reconciliation and humanitarian work. Interview material and personal papers add more to the interesting story of these two outstanding people.

In 1924, a female Chinese Christian believer at Canton Christian College, Liu Fung Ling, spoke of faith in cosmopolitan modernity and the ideals for modern women in the modern world:

“The task that the modern woman has before her is not the copying of the West here and the East there, but rather of creating a new thing through a deeper appreciation of what is best in both....The woman of China

---

<sup>3</sup> Amanda Izzo, “‘By Love, Serve One Another’: Foreign Mission and the Challenge of World Fellowship in the YWCAs of Japan and Turkey,” *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 347-372.

<sup>4</sup> Noriko Ishii, “Difficult Conversations across Religions, Race and Empires: American Women Missionaries and Japanese Christian Women during the 1930s and 1940s,” *JAEAR* 24:3-4 (2017): 371-403.

## H-Diplo Article Review

in her eagerness to follow her western sisters must not forget the legacy that has been handed down to her. Her duty is to make music and harmony out of the world of strife.”<sup>5</sup>

Indeed, Christian cosmopolitanism, as manifested in the diverse range of religious experiences above, allows one to see heterogeneity in new and old social affiliations as an opportunity for egalitarian impulses and self-interrogation. Cosmopolitanism and liberal openness intertwined with nationalism in the modern experience of Asia and the United States. Thus, nation-states and native identity should be just one dimension of our living and lived history. As the title of Jane Hunter’s introduction suggests, cosmopolitanism rooted in Christian faith might be a universal metaphor that is worth further exploring.

© 2019 The Authors | [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 3.0 United States License](#)

---

<sup>5</sup> Liu Fung Ling, “The Epic Woman of China,” *Ling Naam: The News Bulletin of Canton Christian College* 1:1 (August 1924).